Action No.: 120630405P1 E-File No.: ECP13DUDARD

Appeal No.:

IN THE PROVINCIAL COURT OF ALBERTA JUDICIAL CENTRE OF EDMONTON

HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN

v.

DUANE MICHAEL DUDAR

Accused

PROCEEDINGS

Edmonton, Alberta February 8, 2013

Transcript Management Services, Edmonton 1000, 10123 99th Street Edmonton, Alberta T5J-3H1

Phone: (780) 427-6181 Fax: (780) 422-2826

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Descrip	tion		Page
Februar	y 8, 2013	Morning Session	1
Plea		-	1
Particul	ars		2
Submiss	sions by Mr. Lim (Sentence)		5
Submissions by Ms. Norton (Sentence)			8
Sentence		12	
Certificate of Record		17	
Certifica	ate of Transcript		18
	Е	XHIBITS	
No.	Description		Page
S-1	Criminal Record of Accus	sed	6
S-2	Victim Impact Statement		12

1 2	Proceedings taken in the Provincial Court of	Alberta, Law Courts, Edmonton, Alberta
_	February 8, 2013	Morning Session
	The Honourable	The Provincial Court of Alberta
6	Judge Anderson	
7	CMT	F. 4. C
	C.M.T. Lim K.M. Norton	For the Crown
	(Student-at-Law)	
	(Agent for S.J. Fix)	For the Accused
	S. Daniele Court Clerk	
13		
14		
	Plea	
16 17	MR. LIM:	Good morning, Your Honour. For the record,
18		cial Crown prosecutor's office. I appear in the
19	matter of Dudar, Duane Dudar.	- September 2 Sept
20		
21	THE COURT:	Okay.
22		
	MS. NORTON:	Good morning, Sir. Norton
24	MR. LIM:	He's in custody.
26	WIK. LIWI.	The s in custody.
	MS. NORTON:	first initial 'K'.
28		
29	MR. LIM:	Oh, sorry.
30		
	MS. NORTON:	Norton, first initial 'K'. Student-at-Law, Fix
32	and Smith, I'm agent for Mr. Fix on this	matter.
33	MR. LIM:	This is for summary disposition, Sir. I have
35		of a list of the order that we anticipate to go in.
36	It's not quite a joint submission I can let	
37		
38	MS. NORTON:	Sir, this is Mr. Dudar. I can advise you, Sir,
39		s of guilty to count 1 on the Information ending
40	_	count 1 on Information ending 130, count 1 on
41	Inform Information ending 831, count	1 on Information ending 006. As well as some

ticket matters, Sir, ticket ending in 362Z, ticket ending 576Z, ticket ending 712Z, and finally ticket ending 793Z. I have canvassed Section 606 with him, Sir, and he's responded in the affirmative. I understand my friend has the facts.

5 THE COURT: All right.

7 Particulars

9 MR. LIM: Your Honour, if it pleases this Honourable

10 Court, I'll first deal with the file ending in 405.

12 THE COURT:

14 MR. LIM: 405, Sir. The Crown is alleging the following,

in the City of Edmonton, in the Province of Alberta on the date, Sir, of May the 31st, 2012, a member of the Edmonton Police Service was around 107th Avenue and 96th Street completing an investigation on another matter. This police officer who was on duty and uniformed heard the accused seem to be somewhat intoxicated yelling and screaming at a dog that he was possessing on a leash, that being a Golden or a Labrador. He was noted to then be pulling on the leash so hard that it made the dog yelp and then cower and shake uncontrollably.

Okay.

Before the police officer could actually exit his vehicle to intervene, the accused then began to whip the dog with the leash, it appeared to be a leather leash, several times causing the dog again to yelp and cower in extreme fear. It should be noted that the police was yelling at the accused eventually to stop, although the police officer admitted he swore at the accu -- at the accused to stop. The police officer noted that in trying to get the dog -- or to obtain the dog, that the dog was extremely timid, submissive, shaking, appeared to be malnourished and was hiding or cowering under the police vehicle when the Animal Protection or the bylaw officers actually came to attend to try to retrieve the dog. The accused upon being arrested without any prompting said,

I'm not a good guy, so what, I beat the dog. What are you going to do about it?

He then said later on,

I own the world, the Government will pay my tickets. I'm not a great guy.

He was asked why did he whip the dog. He said,

1 2 'Cause I fuckin' own the dog and the world. 3 4 Your Honour. Those are the allegations. 5 6 MS. NORTON: That's admitted, Sir. 8 THE COURT: Okay. 9 10 MR. LIM: But, Your Honour, so the file ending in 657 is a respect to a fail to attend court. Sir, this is in respect to June 15th, 2012, in Edmonton, 11 12 Alberta and it's in respect to a docket matter. 13 14 MS. NORTON: Also admitted, Sir. 15 16 MR. LIM: File 7130, 7130, breach ending in recognizance order, Your Honour. The Crown alleges the following; in the City of 17 Edmonton, in the Province of Alberta between the dates of June 6th, 2012, and June 18th, 18 19 2012, the accused is out on a recognizance order in respect to the -- the charge on the 20 animal cruelty, Sir. One of the terms was requiring him to report to a probation officer. 21 What happened, Your Honour, he was explained that he had to attend to a probation 22 officer on those dates. He didn't attend. There were phone calls made. He still didn't 23 attend, Your Honour. That's the charge before the Court. 24 25 THE COURT: All right. 26 27 MS. NORTON: That's admitted. 28 29 MR. LIM: Next file, Sir, is 831, file ending in 831. The 30 Crown is alleging the following, Sir. In the City of Edmonton, in the Province of Alberta, on September the 4th, 2012, about 11:30 in the evening at the Royal Alexander 31 32 Hospital police were contacted, Your Honour. The accused was noted to be intoxicated 33 and causing a disturbance in the emergency room area. One of the security or one of the 34 members who worked at the Royal Alexander Hospital was trying to deal, or calm down, 35 shall we say, the accused who was making a scene. The accused (sic) tried to bring the --36 Mr. Dudar back to the end of the unit so that he wouldn't interfere with the patients and 37 people around in the emergency ward, Sir. While bringing him to this room he was being belligerent and difficult and extremely intoxicated. 38 39 40 The accused grabbed a chair and then came at the complainant who was able to

eventually grab the chair away from the accused and pushed him to the floor. He

continued, he being Mr. Dudar, with the complainant. While on the floor, the accused kicked the complainant several times and struck him many times in the abdomen and area, groin and legs. The complainant didn't require medical attention. He had some bruising I note, that was my understanding. This was witnessed by two nurses, Your Honour, as well as some other obviously civilians. The police came and arrested the accused. He was noted to be extremely drunk at the time.

8 THE COURT: So the complainant was security?

1 2

10 MR. LIM: Yes.

12 THE COURT: Yes.

14 MS. NORTON: That's admitted, Sir.

16 THE COURT: All right.

18 MR. LIM: File ending in 006, Sir, file ending in 006. The

Crown is alleging on June the 1st, 2012, Your Honour, the accused had just been released obviously on the -- if you may recall the date, May 31st, in respect to the animal cruelty charge. He was, of course, to keep the peace and be of good behaviour. On this, sorry, on September 7th, 2012, the accused was noted to be approaching a residence on 101st Street and 115 -- 18, sorry, Sir.

He forced his way into the residence by breaking through a screen door and a large plate glass door gaining access into this resident house where he used a lawn chair to get in. Once inside he was noted to be searching inside the residence until he was -- was noted by two neighbours who lived nearby, Sir. They saw the accused in the residence knowing that -- familiar with the people living there, knowing that he was not welcome there. So these two civilian witnesses, males, actually approached the accused who was in the residence. They contact the -- the police and maintain watching the exits until the police actually arrived.

When the police did arrive, they attempted to place the accused into handcuffs. He was extremely intoxicated, struggled with them. It was noted that he had a very sma -- strong smell of liquor emanating from him as well, Your Honour. There was a struggle. It was noted that there was -- when the police looked at the place and confirmed with the actual owners of the residence who were away on holidays, that the damage was approximately \$2,000 to the screen door as well as the plate glass door, which were obviously significantly damaged by the chair to get into the residence.

1	MS. NORTON:	That's admitted.
2		
3	THE COURT:	All right.
4		
	MR. LIM:	Your Honour, respect to the ticket I'm sorry,
6	_	This would be ticket ending in 1362. This, Sir, is
7		used again was intoxicated, Your Honour, was
8	•	not welcome there, Sir, not supposed to be there,
9	thus that particular ticket. That is a \$287	nne.
10	MS. NORTON:	That's admitted.
12	MS. NORTON.	That's admitted.
	MR. LIM:	Likewise again, Your Honour, Crown is
14		ton, Alberta, same location accused is found
15		ked to leave and wasn't wasn't supposed to
16		trespass from the previous, Sir, I should explain.
17	·	Your Honour. I think my friend would agree that
18	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	ky 97 in respect to something that happened in
19	2011.	
20		
21	MS. NORTON:	That's correct, Sir.
22		
23	MR. LIM:	The last two tickets, Your Honour, I'm not sure
24	how much detail you want on 4712,	
25		
26	THE COURT:	Not a lot.
27		
	MR. LIM:	5793
29		
30	THE COURT:	Not a lot.
31	MD IIM.	Cin there're an the food value there're
	MR. LIM: they're a Camina and Liquer Act ticket	Sir, they're on the face value, they're
33 34	•	He's found intoxicated on the street by EPS and LE). I don't think there's nothing much more to
35	be said about that.	LE). I don't tillik there's nothing much more to
36	be said about that.	
	MS. NORTON:	I think that's sufficient, Sir. That's admitted.
38	MB. IVOICION.	Time that 8 sufficient, Sh. That 8 admitted.
	Submissions by Mr. Lim (Sentence)	
40		
41	MR. LIM:	Your Honour, in respect to sentencing. We
		- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

aren't quite in agreement, Sir, to the sentencing. The ranges, yes, but not the way it's to be done here. So the suggested sentence is from the Crown, Your Honour, is a -- would be a global and I'll break it down. From 9 to 13 and a half months incarceration, 12 months proba -- probation and a 5-year pet prohibition.

5

6 THE COURT: Sorry again, 9 to 13 and a half months plus --

8 MR. LIM: 9 to 13 and half months.

9

10 THE COURT: -- what?

11

12 MR. LIM: Plus 12 months probation and 10 -- or sorry

5-year pet prohibition, sorry, 5-year pet prohibition. And I can break it down for this

14 Court as to the Crown's suggested sentences served.

1516

17

18

19

20

First of all, my friend has explained to me that there's no issue about the range, she just wants concurrent time on some of the charges. We're in agreement that the filing in 405, that would be the animal cruelty charge, would not be concurrent. So we are in agreement to that and the suggested time we've agreed to is between 15 to 30 days incarceration to be followed by a 5-year pet prohibition.

2122

23

24

25

26

We agree, Your Honour, that the other ancillary orders do not need to be made, which are pursuant to Sections 445 and 4 -- 446 of the *Criminal Code of Canada*. In respect to file ending in 3657, Sir, we're suggesting 15 days consecutive, Your Honour. File ending in 130, fail to attend, in respect to the breach, Your Honour, the Crown is suggesting a 30 to 60 day sentence, that's 130. File ending 831, that's the assault charge, 30 days consecutive with the 12 months probation.

272829

30

31

32

33

File ending in 006, this is the break and enter, Sir, 6 to month -- 6 to 9 months gaol consecutive and we agree that the DNA sampa -- sample can go on this one here, Your Honour. As well, we agree to a weapon prohibition pursuant to Section 109. Your Honour, we have the suggested probation terms before you, if I can pass to madam clerk, as well as the criminal order -- criminal record of the accused, which I believe has been verified with the --

3435

36 MS. NORTON: It has been exhibited, Sir.

37

38 THE COURT: Okay, record will be S-1.

39

40 EXHIBIT S-1 - Criminal Record of Accused

1 MR. LIM: Thank Sir. The you, probation 2 suggesting, Sir, is -- and I've spoken to my friend, we're in agreement in everything except for the al -- the abstaining clause in which alcohol and testing clause. Essentially 3 4 is -- is a reporting condition, Your Honour, maintaining a residence, a designated 5 residence. You will note, the detainee staying within the Province of Alberta, you will 6 note in respect to maintaining employment or trying to create a positive environment from 7 him. We've also made sure that 'cause he has some medical issues that he may not be 8 able to work, that he, of course, could provide a medical letter to his doctor if he's unable 9 to work for that clause there.

1011

12

13

14

15

For assessment and treatment, Your Honour, we're looking obviously at the one that seems to be the most prominent, looking at his criminal record, that being alcohol, as well as anger management, domestic violence, Sir -- sorry anger management and psychiatric and psychological issues. Actually domestic violence does not -- I don't know why that is circled, Your Honour, sorry that was in error, it does need to be done in this particular case here.

16 17

18 MS. NORTON: Thank you.

19

20 MR. LIM: I think my friend would agree with that.

21

22 MS. NORTON: Yes, Sir.

23

24 MR. LIM: Of course there should be a waiver so that -- of information to allow for such assessment and treatment to be done. The Crown -- and this is not agree -- this is one part we don't agree on is the abstaining clause, Sir. The Crown believe that there should be a abstaining clause and a testing clause to enforce it. Essentially looking at the criminal record, the allegations before the Court including the tickets, this person obviously has a problem with alcohol.

30 31

32

33

34

35

36

And it seems like not only when he drinks, he also becomes obviously a danger to the public, whether it be a dog, whether it be a security person at the hospital or to a house -- a home residence. Some people may argue, of course, that a person who has an alcohol problem can't stay off it but in this case here this Crown is suggesting -- we've considered *Ipeelee* and the early guilty plea in *Gladue* and sentencing here that if he can't stay away from the alcohol, then perhaps it should be more gaol time, so consider that in our sentencing approach here.

373839

40

41

We want to give him an early case resolution offer that looked at the early plea, the strength of the Crown's case as well as his criminal record. My understanding is that the accused wishes to apply to get concurrent time in respect to -- in respect to with the break

and enter with the other charges other than the animal cruelty charge, that's file 405. I've 1 2 explained to my friend that we're not in agreement to that, we don't think it's appropriate. The Crown considering that we've already considered an offer that looked at *Ipeelee*, 3 4 Gladue and the early guilty plea. And of course the -- even the nature of the -- the group 5 or the -- if you want to call it the -- the multiple charges that have been pled to here as 6 well as the tickets.

7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

I note, Your Honour, that if you see the criminal record, he's gotten gaol time already on breaches as well as property offences, not to mention alcohol related offences. He has an unlawful entry that's relatively recent. His criminal record is constant, current and consistent and also the property offences. So the break and enter, Your Honour, which is in a residence even given 6 to 9 months really does consider his unique circumstances that he's gone through in respect to *Ipeelee* and *Gladue* and the number of charges he's pled guilty to. We don't see how the other charges are related and therefore should be considered in respect to concurrent time but rather should be consecutive.

16 17

18

19

20

We also note that there are real victims here; there was a dog, there was a -- people who own the house, civilians had to deal with that, as well as the hospital there was a man who was just trying to do his job and, of course, is assaulted by the accused in a vulnerable situation there in the public.

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

Your Honour, respect to the pet prohibition, this Court can obviously understand that that's on the file ending in 405, the animal probation. The probation I will leave with the Court, but we are suggesting the assault, although we did I notice put down to look at on the psychiatric or on the assessment issue about animal care. If you want you can put a 445 or the -- the break and enter as well, but I'll leave that up to the Court as to what the -- the probation order, if you accept, should be on, Sir, on the length of time. Those are my submissions, Sir, unless you have any questions?

28 29

31

30 THE COURT: Thank you.

33

32 Submissions by Ms. Norton (Sentence)

34 MS. NORTON: Sir, my friend has done a fair job of -- of 35 summarizing my position on sentencing. I am asking, Sir, for the low end of the range that he has suggested for the break and enter charge, 6 months on that charge. The -- the 36 37 low end of the range is he's proposed on the other charges concurrent to that charge and then a consecutive 15 days to the -- to that charge with the -- the cruelty to animal 38 39 charge, Sir. So that would be a global sentence of 6 months and 15 days, Sir, on -- on 40 everything. And then, of course, probation and the -- the pet prohibition. Sir, with regards 41 to probation, as my friend indicated, I am in opposition to the abstinence clause and I will

elaborate upon my reasons for that, Sir when I dis --

1 2

3 THE COURT: Well, that's obvious. What is the whole 4 purpose -- what is the point even of probation?

5

7 8

6 MS. NORTON:

Sir, Mr. Dudar has indicated a strong desire to rebuild -- rehabilitate himself essentially, Sir, and I feel probation would assist him in that. I do have -- I do not have a formal letter in court for you, Sir, but I do have some information the way in fact on his aboriginal history, Sir.

9 10 11

12

13

Mr. Dudar's 38 years of age, he does have 2 children, teenagers who he has limited contact with. He completed grade 11, Sir, and he isn't working due to health issues. He advises me he has two smashed vertebrae, he suffers from seizures, Hepatitis C and liver damage due to his drinking, Sir.

14 15 16

17

18

19

20

With respect to Mr. Dudar's aboriginal background, Sir, I can advise you Mr. Dudar is Metis. He was born in Athabasca, has three brothers and sisters, he was adopted at birth, Sir. He advises that the foster parents he resided with moved around to various communities in Alberta and that his -- his upbringing with them was unstable due to the fact that they were moving fairly regularly. He also advises me, Sir, that he was abused by his foster parents.

21 22 23

24

25

26

27

Mr. Dudar was seized by Social Services when he was 13 or 14 years old. He was put in a group home at that time. Mr. Dudar advises me that he ran away from that group home and spent the remainder of his youthful years in and out of EYOC and various group homes. Sir, he also advises me he began drinking when he was 16 and I think you can clearly see in the Informations and the facts laid out before you, Sir, that his drinking problem is certainly what's brought him before you today.

28 29 30

31

32

33

34

35

With regards to Mr. Dudar's personal circumstances, Sir, I can advise he later moved to Athabasca. He advises me he did meet his birth mother. He then spent a period of time on the Big Stone Cree Reserve where he met the partner who would be the mother of his children, although they're not together anymore. He was with her for 6 to 7 years on the reserve then returned to Calgary for a couple years then finally settled in Edmonton again. He advises me, Sir, that he has limited contact with his parents, his ex-partner, his siblings and his children and he attributes that all due to his alcohol abuse.

36 37 38

39

40

41

With respect to treatment, Sir, Mr. Dudar advises me that he did occasionally attend Alcoholics Anonymous prior to 2012. He ended up in the hospital in the late -- late spring 2012 due to liver problems resulting from alcohol abuse. He did go to AADAC detox after that incident and then to Henwood for the summer of 2012 and I do believe

that most of the Information's before you. The offences occur either prior to or subsequent to that time in Henwood. Sir, he advises me that he relapsed after he was out of Henwood in September and since then he has certainly come to appreciate the very significant and detrimental impact that his alcohol problem has had on his life. He has taken steps to remedy that, Sir.

1 2

He's attending church services while he's been in custody. He's connected with the Corrections Transitions program. Again while in custody, and Sir, that's a program through Alberta Health Services that deals with mental health and addictions issues. And I've had the opportunity of speaking with his case worker, Jamie, and her words were, That he's been active and motivated in dealing with his addictions, Sir. She was prepared to provide a letter to me but unfortunately she took an unexpected leave and for that reason I'm not able to provide a letter from Jamie to the Court. But she did advise me that she's been meeting with him approximately twice a month since he's been in custody. In September they've had one on one counselling. He has been working with her and now with another case worker towards developing a relapse prevention program.

Perhaps more significantly, Sir, the Transitions program is one that's prepared to work with Mr. Dudar once he's out of custody. So we're not going to run into a situation where Mr. Dudar is released from custody and out in the community with no supports. Instead, Sir, they are working on a plan with him to attend the Gunn Centre. I understand that he's -- he's intending to work with the Gunn Centre for approximately one year following his release from custody. And the Gunn Centre is a treatment facility that caters to people with addictions and also medical concerns, which makes it a good fit for Mr. Dudar with his health issues.

The Corrections Transition program is also going connect him with Housing First, which is an independent living program, Sir. So with the assistance of the Corrections Transition program when Mr. Dudar's sentence is completed his -- when his custodial sentence is complete and he's released, he will have supports in place both for housing and for some form of relapse prevention, Sir.

With respect to the sentence, Sir, my friend is correct in noting that the incidents are unrelated but I would ask, Sir, that you consider the totality principle in imposing a sentence on Mr. Dudar. And I would suggest that applying all of the sentences consecutively would result in a situation where the sentence imposed may exceed Mr. Dudar's culpability, particularly given the requirements of *Ipeelee*, Sir, where you're required to consider both systemic and the background factors and how that may impact on Mr. Dudar's culpability.

So, Sir, in closing, I propose a 6 month sentence. Again, 6 months on the break and enter

charge, Sir, 30 days concurrent on the assault, 30 days again concurrent and 15 days 1 2 concurrent on the fail to comply and the fail to appear. And I am in agreement with my friend, 15 days consecutive for the cruelty to animal charge, Sir. So the global charge --3 4 or global disposition of 6 months and 15 days and 12 months probation, Sir, again no abstinence provision and a 5-year pet prohibition. Subject to any questions, Sir, those are 5 6 my submissions. 7 8 MR. LIM: Your Honour, the only comment that I think 9 we'll make jointly to you, Sir, if you'll consider is that in respect to the tickets, the 10 trespass ones are a set one of \$287, as the Court may know. The Gaming and Liquor Act is \$115 each, including other surcharges. 11 12 13 MS. NORTON: Thank you, Sir, and I -- I take no -- no comments on the fines. They -- they are what they are, Sir. 14 15 16 MR. LIM: I need to let the Court know that there is also a victim impact statement filed on the file ending in 006, which madam clerk, I think, has 17 copies for us to review. In respect to the file ending in 405, the police officer just had 18 19 extreme concerns about Marley the dog but it's not really a victim impact statement, it's 20 just concerned about the safety of the dog. If we could perhaps, Your Honour, with your 21 approval review the victim impact statements on the break and enter charge? 22 Yes. 23 THE COURT: 24 25 MR. LIM: Thank you, Sir. If I can just approach, madam 26 clerk. 27 28 (OTHER MATTER SPOKEN TO) 29 30 MR. LIM: Does my friend have any difficulties with this complying with the *Criminal Code* in respect to be admissible? 31 32 33 MS. NORTON: I -- I have no difficulties with this. 34 35 MR. LIM: If that could be marked as Exhibit S-2, with my 36 friend's consent. 37 38 MS. NORTON: Certainly. 39 40 THE COURT: All right.

1 EXHIBIT S-2 - Victim Impact Statement 2 3 THE COURT: All right. I have read the victim impact statement. Mr. Dudar, anything you want to say? 4 5 6 THE ACCUSED: Yeah. I -- I pretty well -- yeah, I got an alcohol problem. Like, all my charges are all alc -- due to alcohol. If I wasn't drinking I 7 8 wouldn't be in trouble. All this is all alcohol related, everything I've done. My whole 9 record's alcohol related. When I'm not drinking I'm not like this, I don't do anything like 10 this. Half these things I don't even remember, I was blacked out. I was -- not even my, I 11 don't remember it, that's how bad it was. 12 13 Feel sorry for what I done but I don't even remember it. You know, and trying to get 14 help for my alcohol problem. I've got a transition team that's working with me right 15 now. And when I get out of here they're going to try, I'm going to go to Gunn 16 Treatment Centre for a year. They're helping me get into that and helping me get off the 17 street and my homeless -- I'm homeless so help me get my own place and help me with my, yeah, alcohol problem. So that -- I'm hoping that works out for me and that's pretty 18 19 well -- I'm hoping everything works out when I get -- when I get out of here and that's 20 about all I can say. I just hopefully it'll work on my alcohol problem. 21 22 THE COURT: All right. Is there any presentence custody? 23 24 MS. NORTON: There is, Sir. I was just going to mention that 25 actually. He's been in for 5 months and 2 days as of today. 26 27 MR. LIM: If it assists this Court we calculate it to 154 28 days, Your Honour. 29 30 MS. NORTON: Sorry, I think that would be 155. I did notice I 31 missed one day when we were speaking earlier. 32 33 MR. LIM: Okay, 155, Your Honour. 34 35 MS. NORTON: Thank you. 36 37 **Sentence** 38 39 THE COURT: All right. Well, first of all with respect to the

four charges under the provincial legislation, I am going to impose the specified penalties, in default of payment, deemed days. In the final analysis, I am imposing a global

40

sentence of 7 months, less time served. And in doing so I am approaching it as we are directed to approach it under *Gladue*. And looking at your background circumstances and then trying to fit the offences into that background context given respect to the objectives of sentencing.

456

7

8

9

10

1 2

3

And of course, the primary thing is that the offences have to fit the crime. I realize these are alcohol related offences, that has been a scourge of your life, it has also jeopardized your health obviously seriously and you are very wise to be working with a transition team to try and beat that problem because I am sure if you do then you will not be such a menace to yourself and society generally. I see the apportionment of (INDISCERNIBLE) of the sentences a little bit differently than has been suggested.

111213

14

15

16

17

18

The break and enter, which given the level of intoxication and the question really of what was actually intended there but nonetheless, the inconvenience associated with a break and entry, I think the range suggested is high, actually, and I am going to cut you some slack on that. And on that offence I would have imposed a sentence of 3 months. On the assault at the hospital, I agree that a sentence of 30 days is appropriate. It is completely unrelated; there is no reason to make it consecutive. It would have been consecutive for a total of 4 months.

19 20 21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

With respect to the two breach related charges, I am making those sentences concurrent. I will impose a sentence of 15 days on the Information ending in 57 and 30 days on the other. But I am making them concurrent and I am going that partly because of the overall totality principle but also because of course those are -- you have, of course, because of your repeated misbehaviour ended up back in gaol. You are getting some credit for time but you are not getting any credit for remission. And when I throw all of that into the .PP Which leaves then the mix I think concurrent sentences on that are appropriate. cruelty to animal and I appreciate both counsel suggest that the range of sentence should be 15 to 30 days. I disagree. As you may have gleaned from the sentences that I have seen or I have been imposing in relation to the other matters, when a person is disadvantaged and is committing offences as a result of having been dealt a poor deck of cards and the like, I tend to be quite sympathetic. When people whip or kick dogs though, I am not sympathetic. Because surely, when you are sober and you look at that taking advantage of the creature that cannot defend itself, the exploitation of others, which frankly you yourself have been a victim of, is not justified and is simply going to be punished because there is no explanation that justifies it. So that is why I would impose a sentence of 3 months consecutive on that.

373839

40

41

Now in the final analysis you end up with a sentence that is at the lower end of what has been submitted but I want to make that point. You are also prohibited from possessing any kind of an animal as a pet for a period of 5 years. And I will impose a probation

order in addition to the assault or attached to the assault charge. You will be on probation for a period of 12 months. There are very few conditions. The conditions are that you have to keep the peace and be of good behaviour, report to the court when required, and you have to report to probation within a couple of days, two days, of your working days of your release and then after that as directed by probation.

1 2

It is not a condition of the order but I am encouraging you to work with the transition team through your case worker and through the probation officer who is going to be assuming conduct of your situation once you are out so that you can have a concrete game plan in place as you are trying to do right now. And there will then be a general condition that you attend for whatever assessment, treatment or counselling is directed by the probation office. I am not doing that to motivate you to take treatment, you are motivated. The question is trying to create a structure which maximizes the chances of you being successful in that.

And I am not imposing a condition that you abstain absolutely because you have demonstrated that in the past you have been incapable of complying with that kind of a condition. But you, of course, have to know that if you keep drinking everything else is going to unravel anyway, so you have to make that part of your plan. All right. Victim fine surcharges are waived.

22 MR. LIM: Your Honour, may I ask the wording respect to 23 the pet prohibition. In the past, we suggested be worded as not own, possess, control any 24 pet or animal for 5 years. I'm just wondering if that would be appropriate, Sir?

26 THE COURT: Not -- what?

28 MR. LIM: Not own, possess, control any pet or animal for 29 5 years.

31 THE COURT: What does control mean?

33 MR. LIM: Meaning he can't supervise, like, you know, a dog in respect to like a job or something like that around his house.

36 THE COURT: All right.

38 MR. LIM: In other words, if (INDISCERNIBLE) he's want to babysit should we say a dog or a pet.

41 THE COURT: Yes. I will use the word supervise rather than

1 2	control.	
3 4	MR. LIM:	All right.
	THE COURT:	I think it would be misleading.
	MR. LIM: understands that, Sir, the pet prohibition.	Can we confirm on the record that he
10 11 12	THE COURT: that? Okay, you cannot look after pets.	Do you have any lack of understanding about Cannot own them, cannot look after them.
	THE ACCUSED: pets. (INDISCERNIBLE)	Well, then pets all over my family all have
16 17 18	THE COURT: them.	Well, you cannot be the one that is supervising
19 20	THE ACCUSED: there.	I won't have them. There's enough out of
21222324	THE COURT: gave you 3 months.	Well, if that is true then you understand why I
	THE ACCUSED:	Yeah, I understand what you mean.
		Your Honour, the Crown would apply to And seeking the forfeiture of the all exhibits) still want them dealt with to Her Majesty the
	THE COURT:	Why does that require forfeiture?
		In respect to there was if there's any issue animal can be adopted after that we're applying
	THE COURT: imagine there would be.	Well, is there an issue? Because I cannot
	MR. LIM:	I don't see it on the file here.

1		
2 3	MS. NORTON:	I don't see that there is one, Sir.
	THE COURT:	I have never heard of forfeiting a dog.
5		
	MR. LIM:	It allows us to do that. I just want to make
7	sure that	
8	THE COURT	
9 10	THE COURT:	I think you can do that.
	MR. LIM:	Fair enough, Sir.
12	IVIIC. EIIVI.	Tan chough, Sh.
	THE COURT:	I am not going to do forfeiture but are there
14		
15		
16	MR. LIM:	Thank you, Your Honour, those are my matters.
17		
18	THE COURT:	Thank you.
19		
	MS. NORTON:	Thank you, Sir, that's my only matter as well.
21	Good morning.	
22	THE COURT	Madaus Chada da assa hassa dha tassa dhat I bast
	THE COURT:	Madam Clerk, do you have the terms that I just
2425	read out?	
	THE COURT CLERK:	I got them, thanks.
27	THE COURT CLERK.	1 got them, thanks.
	- <u>-</u>	
29	PROCEEDINGS CONCLUDED	
30	-	
31		
32		
33		
34		
35		
36		
3738		
30 39		
40		
41		

1 Certificate of Record

2 3

I, Samantha Daniele, certify that the recording is the record made of the evidence in the proceedings in the Provincial Court, held in courtroom 446 at Edmonton, Alberta, on the 8th day of February, 2013, that myself and Marlene Kassian were the court officials in charge of the sound-recording machine during the proceedings.

1 Certificate of Transcript I, Kim Moon, certify that (a) I transcribed the record, which was recorded by a sound-recording machine to the best of my skill and ability and the foregoing pages are a complete and accurate transcript of the contents of the record, and (b) the Certificate of Record for these proceedings was included orally on the record and is transcribed in this transcript. Digitally Certified: 2013-05-30 06:16:32 Kim Moon, Transcriber Order No. 39726-13-1 35 Pages: 36 Lines: 37 Characters: 38 — 39 File Locator: 0686404cc91b11e294af0017a4770810 40 Digital Fingerprint: 0491f15281c30e41429dfddeab9e76816f6282cf1356a2c3a4600572730c50d1 41 —

Detailed Transcript Statistics		
Order No. 39726-13-1		
Page Statistics		
Title Pages:	1	
ToC Pages:	1	
Transcript Pages:	18	
Total Pages:	20	
Line Statistics		
Title Page Lines:	50	
ToC Lines:	10	
Transcript Lines:	743	
Total Lines:	803	
Visible Character Count Statistics		
Title Page Characters:	488	
ToC Characters:	222	
Transcript Characters:	28448	
Total Billable Characters:	29158	
Multi-Take Adjustment: (-) Duplicated Title Page Characters	28670	